



**HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

April 13, 2015

**City Hall Kiva
3839 N. Drinkwater Blvd
Scottsdale, AZ 85251**

PRESENT: Bob Fox, Chair
James Campbell, Vice-Chair
Ragan Grossman, Commissioner
Ricoh Danielson, Commissioner
Lonny Ruben, Commissioner
Laurie Coe, Commissioner
Andrew Song, Commissioner

STAFF: Sharon Cini
David Simmons

GUESTS: Virginia Korte, Council Member
Linda Milhaven, Council Member
David Smith, Council Member
Kathy Littlefield, Council Member
Bob Littlefield
Florita Campbell
Daria Lohman
Andy Kern
Alec Thomson
Elaine Laneprie
Erica Keppler
Brion Neeley
Carol Consalno
Josh Zaragoza
Laura Copple

CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

Vice-Chair Fox called the meeting to order at 5:04 p.m.

Members were present as indicated above.

1. Approval of minutes from the March 9, 2015 meeting

VICE-CHAIR CAMPBELL MOVED TO APPROVE THE MARCH 9, 2015 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER COE SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

2. Public Comment

Daria Lohman spoke about the shortcomings in the Unity Pledge, stressing the need for a reporting mechanism and protections from retaliation.

Andy Kern suggested that a study be done on the negative impacts of the City's anti-discrimination law and that if Council chooses to encourage businesses to sign the Unity Pledge, that the businesses that choose not sign the pledge also be made public knowledge.

Alec Thomson, representing the Human Rights Campaign, conveyed feedback heard from citizens following the decision by City Council not to move forward with the public outreach process for a non-discrimination ordinance. A great number of people both following the City Council meeting and attending the Pride Festival in Phoenix are in favor of having public outreach for a non-discrimination ordinance. Mr. Thomson requested that the HRC recommend reconsideration to City Council.

Laura Copple encouraged the City to take part in a broad conversation regarding LGBT discrimination protections.

Brion Neeley stressed that a non-discrimination ordinance is needed because discrimination against the LGBT community does exist in Scottsdale. He opined that the Unity Pledge is a positive statement and is a step in the right direction, but that a City ordinance would be more effective. He urged like-minded citizens to contact Council Members asking to have public outreach on the issue of protections against discrimination.

Erica Keppler, representing Human Equal Rights Organizers, felt that the Unity Pledge is a positive step in the right direction of recognizing that LGBT citizens and visitors are valued in the community. She recalled that in 2007 Council was asked to consider three new ordinances and enacted an ordinance restricting anti-LGBT discrimination for City employees. She asked that the HRC recommend to Council that they reconsider the possibility of an ordinance restricting anti-LGBT discrimination to City contractors and an ordinance restricting anti-LGBT discrimination in all businesses within the city.

David Simmons reported that the City of Scottsdale representatives had a positive experience manning an exhibitor booth at the Phoenix Pride Festival and during their

outreach received both positive and negative feedback. The negative feedback was that many people commented that Scottsdale is not welcoming to the LGBT population.

Josh Zaragoza stressed the importance of the City moving forward with an anti-discrimination Ordinance, noting that it would be good for tourism and the economy.

3. Presentation, discussion, and approval of the 2014 Human Relations Commission Annual report

Vice-Chairman Campbell thanked Ms. Cini for being thorough and completing the Annual Report in a timely manner.

VICE-CHAIR CAMPBELL MOVED TO APPROVE THE 2014 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION ANNUAL REPORT. COMMISSIONER GROSSMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

Ms. Cini noted that Vice-Chair Campbell had perfect attendance during the 2014 year.

4. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendations to staff liaison regarding Council's direction to staff at the nondiscrimination work study session

Ms. Cini reported that during the March 31, 2015 City Council work study session, staff was directed to expand the Unity Pledge as a way to bring together the community and to monitor the success of this action; evaluate a response to the needs of the LGBT citizens and visitors who come to Scottsdale; to conduct proactive public outreach; and encourage local businesses to sign the Unity Pledge as a social contract against discrimination. Staff will ensure that the City's efforts are observable and measurable and are considering utilizing other City mechanisms such as the Economic Development Department, the Scottsdale Chamber of Commerce, and the Scottsdale Convention and Visitors Bureau to aid with those efforts. Because the Unity Pledge belongs to ONE Community, staff has scheduled a meeting with ONE Community on April 23rd to discuss how the City and ONE Community can continue collaborating.

Commission members were given the opportunity to make comments.

Chair Fox stressed the importance of including other protected classes as part of efforts moving forward. Ms. Cini noted that other protected classes are protected through laws. She suggested that the Human Relations Commission could recommend the Unity Pledge be applied to all protected classes.

Ms. Cini discussed the comprehensive public surveys conducted by the City of Mesa that helped them design their anti-discrimination program.

Extensive discussion ensued regarding encouraging Council to move forward with citizen surveys and public outreach, how to fund a public survey, potential backlash to businesses who do not take the Unity Pledge, and a possible Civil Dialogue series on the topic of non-discrimination laws,

CHAIR FOX MOVED TO DIRECT THE STAFF LIAISON WITH THE ASSISTANCE OF COMMISSION MEMBERS TO WORK TO GATHER MORE DATA AND/OR SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF ALLEGATIONS OF DISCRIMINATION ACROSS THE SPECTRUM OF POTENTIAL PROTECTED GROUPS, WITH THE INTENT OF SHARING THE RESULTS WITH THE CITY COUNCIL AND THAT THE LIAISON WORK WITH THE COMMISSION ON REVIEWING A POTENTIAL "ONE SCOTTSDALE PLEDGE" AS A POSSIBLE ALTERNATIVE TO THE UNITY PLEDGE. COMMISSIONER RUBEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

Vice-Chair Campbell suggested amending the motion to assign two members of the Commission to work with the staff liaison so as to not have communication that inadvertently violates the open meeting law.

THE ORIGINAL MOTION CARRIED WITH A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ONE (1). VICE-CHAIR CAMPBELL DISSENTED.

5. Presentation, discussion and recommendations to staff liaison regarding possible community engagement activities

Commissioners Grossman and Ruben gave a PowerPoint presentation outlining the idea of hosting an annual hike starting at on one of the McDowell Sonoran Preserve's trailheads promoting diversity awareness, tolerance, respect, equality, acceptance, and diversity in lieu of four Civil Dialogue Series events. The hike would be sponsored by the Human Relations Commission and partner organizations, would be inclusive of all groups that experience discrimination, and would be open to all citizens of Scottsdale and the Valley to participate. Activities could include healthy food vendors and activities in addition to the hike and would offer a platform for people and businesses to express their opinions and experiences and would be an opportunity for businesses to come out and sign the Unity Pledge.

Discussion ensued regarding potential activities and possible challenges that could be posed by having the event at a trailhead and the possibility of finding sponsorship for the event. Commission members discussed the possibility of having one Civil Dialogue Series event in addition to the hike. The Civil Dialogue Series could be on a topic relating to diversity and tolerance.

CHAIR FOX MOVED TO APPROVE COMMISSIONERS ENGAGING WITH THE STAFF LIAISON WITH IDEAS ABOUT AN ANNUAL HIKE EVENT AND AN ANNUAL CIVIL DIALOGUE ACTIVITY. COMMISSIONER GROSSMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

6. Staff updates regarding upcoming diversity events and activities

Ms. Cini announced that Scottsdale Family Services is hosting a Teen Expo and Career Fair for young adults on Wednesday, April 15th at SkySong beginning at 2:30 p.m..

Adapted Recreation had an open house for their multisensory room and facilities last week. Ms. Cini recommended that Commission members take a tour of the facility.

The Mayor's Committee on Employment of People with Disabilities is accepting applications for scholarships for students continuing college who are living with a disability. Ms. Cini noted that there is generally an event held in October that includes an awards ceremony recognizing employees of the year, businesses, teachers who have excelled in helping students meet their goals, and awarding scholarships.

Ms. Cini reported on the Phoenix Indian Center Silver and Turquoise Gala, noting that Scottsdale was thanked for hosting an opportunity for students to come to the City and learn about various careers.

The Diversity Leadership Alliance will host a free workshop focusing on "Understanding Mainstreams and Margins: Your Leadership Skill" on May 7th at the Franciscan Renewal Center.

Scottsdale Community College is hosting an event recognizing Genocide Awareness Week from April 13th through April 18th. Throughout the week various speakers including Holocaust survivors and presenters will discuss peace and global studies.

Human Relations Commissioners participated in Scottsdale Leadership's Diversity Day. Ms. Cini noted that the current class will be graduating in May.

Ms. Cini spoke about her positive experience at the Phoenix Pride Festival.

7. Report from Chair

Chair Fox noted that he made a presentation during the Scottsdale Leadership Diversity Day. His presentation focused on misconceptions around immigration and falsities in American history. He noted that the majority of those in attendance expressed disappointment in City Council's actions during the non-discrimination work study session.

Chair Fox stressed the importance of connecting with the business community and creating opportunities to promote equality and diversity in the City of Scottsdale.

8. Commissioner Items

Commissioner Coe said that she is passionate about the happenings at the City Council non-discrimination work study session and plans to do her part in public outreach on the topic.

Commissioner Ruben noted that he attended "The Empowerment Project", a women's event. He also volunteered at the Phoenix Pride Festival. He thanked Councilwoman Milhaven for standing up for LGBT rights during the recent City Council work study session.

Vice-Chair Campbell noted that he attended the City Council work study session and complemented Ms. Cini on her presentation and all the work she has done for the Commission in her short time as the liaison. He announced that Mayor Lane will be the guest speaker at the Asian Pacific Islanders Community Action (APCA) event on May 9th. He noted that he attended the Vietnamese Cultural Affair.

Commissioner Danielson opined that an anti-discrimination ordinance would be in the best interest of the City and its citizens.

Commissioner Song apologized for missing the previous two Commission meetings and welcomed the two new commissioners. He encouraged Commission members to attend the upcoming APCA event. The city is will not purchase/sponsor a table this year.

9. Discussion regarding the draft agenda for the next meeting and dates, times and topics for upcoming meetings

Ms. Cini asked that Commission members communicate with her prior to the next meeting with Civil Dialogue topic suggestions.

Ms. Cini noted that she will agendize a discussion about prioritizing sponsored events.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 7:06 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz